

Benefits of Technology Executive Summary

Autism spectrum disorder (ASD) is a developmental disability affecting about 1 out of 59 children (Baio 2018), and is commonly characterized by difficulties with communication, social interaction, perspective taking, and emotional regulation (Baio, 2014; Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2016). Children with ASD usually have difficulty understanding other people's emotions or understanding perspective of others (perspective taking) (Sticher, Laffey, Galyen, & Herzog, 2014).

It has been reported that many people with ASD have an affinity for computers and video games, which could increase their motivation for engaging in these programs (Ferguson, Gillis, & Sevlever, 2013). The following paper is a brief summary of a literature review focusing on the use of virtual-reality (VR) in clinical and educational settings with children and youth with ASD. This literature review turned up 182 studies. Of these, 21 fit our criteria. We have organized those 21 studies into three sections: social participation, learning, and daily skills.

Social participation: It has been shown that the use of virtual learning environments have potential to improve **social functioning** among individuals with ASD. Many studies have found that children with ASD are able to improve their social skills, understanding of empathy, and decision-making when using an educational program through virtual environment such as a 3D computer game (Rice et al., 2015; Cheng et al., 2010; Cheng, Chian, Ye & Cheng, 2010; Cheng, Huang, & Yang, 2015; Didehbani et al., 2016; Chung, Han, Shin, & Renshaw, 2016). More specifically, VR-based programs have been found to increase *communication skills* such as, initiation, greeting, and conversation-ending in children with ASD (Ke & Im, 2013). Previous studies have also shown that using VR systems for improving *play skills* results in a significant advancement in play abilities, an improvement in collaborative play, and increased frequency and duration of effective social interactions in children with ASD (Herrera et al., 2008; Gal et al., 2016; Ozen, 2015; Bai, Blackwell, & Coulouris, 2015).

Using a virtual environment can also improve **emotion recognition** and enhance empathy with others in individuals with ASD. Previous studies have illustrated that the use of a human-like avatar (i.e., characters on the screen) in a virtual-learning-environment can help individuals with ASD to better recognize emotions and respond to them appropriately (Moore et al., 2005; Chen, Lee, & Lin 2015; Kim et al., 2015). Researchers have also observed that using video modelling in a VR environment can help children with ASD to maintain their attention while simultaneously helping them to understand facial expressions and emotions (Chen, Lee, & Lin, 2016).

Learning: The use of a virtual-learning environment to improve **cognitive skills** in individuals with ASD is another area of investigation. Researchers have found using VR results in an increase in memory performance for children with ASD (Hsu & Teoh, 2017). These authors analyzed the use of a novel avatar interviewing aid during memory interviews, scavenger hunts, and intelligence assessments, and found that using an avatar was a more “ASD friendly” method of improving recall memory in young children with ASD when compared to using a human interviewer. Using a virtual-learning environment has also been found to be effective for teaching school curriculum to adolescents with ASD. One study found that using 3D virtual learning as a means of distance education increases social competence through knowledge and social practice for youth with ASD (Stichter et al., 2014). Likewise, another study found that use of distance teaching program increases embodied presence and copresence (the sense of one’s own avatar, the sense of proximity of other user’s avatar, and the sense of the social actor “behind” the other avatar) in almost all of the online activities (Wang et al., 2016).

Daily Skills: A few studies have found benefits in the use of a virtual reality systems to improve specific daily skills. For example, using a VR café system was beneficial in teaching teenagers with ASD how to sit or how to maneuver through tables and chairs while in a restaurant (Parsons et al., 2004; Mitchell et al., 2007). Alternatively, it has also been found that VR can be used to teach safety skills such as street-crossing, fire safety, and tornado safety (Self, Scudder, Weheba, & Crumrine, 2007; Goldsmith, 2009). One study found that using a fully-immersive virtual room is an effective treatment for addressing some phobias or fears in individuals with ASD (Maskey et al., 2014).

Overall, these studies suggest that using a virtual-learning environment for children and youth with ASD can be a beneficial way to improve social skills and emotion recognition, as well as teaching specific daily skills and learning skills. The existing research supports the use of VR for learning and/or therapy for children and youth with ASD. However, none of the studies we reviewed received a strong score on the Quality Assessment Tool from the Effective Public Health Practice Project. 14 of the studies reviewed received a weak score, and 7 studies received a moderate score. This suggests that future research should focus on a more rigorous study design to strengthen the evidence-base. As well, the utilization rate of current technologies in rehabilitation and/or learning environments is low, potentially due to ambiguities regarding the cost-effective analysis and clinical decision making of using VR for the wide heterogeneous group of individuals with ASD. Future research should analyze this further and propose a framework on what are the effective ways to use individualized VR platforms to help with learning and/or therapy related to social participation for children with autism in clinics, schools, community centres, and homes.

References

- Bai, Z., Blackwell, A. F., & Coulouris, G. (2015). Using augmented reality to elicit pretend play for children with autism. *IEEE transactions on visualization and computer graphics*, *21*(5), 598-610.
- Baio, J. (2014). Prevalence of Autism Spectrum Disorder Among Children Aged 8 Years — Autism and Developmental Disabilities Monitoring Network, 11 Sites, United States, 2010. *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention*.
- Baio, J., et al. (2018). Prevalence of autism spectrum disorder among children aged 8 years—Autism and Developmental Disabilities Monitoring Network, 11 Sites, United States, 2014. *MMWR Surveillance Summaries*, *67*, 1-23.
- Bekele, E., Crittendon, J., Zheng, Z., Swanson, A., Weitlauf, A., Warren, Z., & Sarkar, N. (2014). Assessing the utility of a virtual environment for enhancing facial affect recognition in adolescents with autism. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, *44*(7), 1641-1650.
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2016). *Autism Spectrum Disorder (ASD)*. Retrieved from <http://www.cdc.gov/ncbddd/autism/data.html>
- Chen, C. H., Lee, I. J., & Lin, L. Y. (2015). Augmented reality-based self-facial modeling to promote the emotional expression and social skills of adolescents with autism spectrum disorders. *Research in developmental disabilities*, *36*, 396-403.
- Chen, C. H., Lee, I. J., & Lin, L. Y. (2016). Augmented reality-based video-modeling storybook of nonverbal facial cues for children with autism spectrum disorder to improve their perceptions and judgments of facial expressions and emotions. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *55*, 477-485.
- Cheng, Y., & Ye, J. (2010). Exploring the social competence of students with autism spectrum conditions in a collaborative virtual learning environment—The pilot study. *Computers & Education*, *54*(4), 1068-1077.
- Cheng, Y., Chiang, H. C., Ye, J., & Cheng, L. H. (2010). Enhancing empathy instruction using a collaborative virtual learning environment for children with autistic spectrum conditions. *Computers & Education*, *55*(4), 1449-1458.
- Cheng, Y., Huang, C. L., & Yang, C. S. (2015). Using a 3D immersive virtual environment system to enhance social understanding and social skills for children with autism spectrum disorders. *Focus on Autism and Other Developmental Disabilities*, *30*(4), 222-236.
- Chung, U. S., Han, D. H., Shin, Y. J., & Renshaw, P. F. (2016). A prosocial online game for social cognition training in adolescents with high-functioning autism: An fMRI study. *Neuropsychiatric disease and treatment*, *12*, 651.
- Didehbani, N., Allen, T., Kandalafi, M., Krawczyk, D., & Chapman, S. (2016). Virtual reality social cognition training for children with high functioning autism. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *62*, 703-711.
- Ferguson, B. R., Gillis, J. M., & Sevelever, M. (2013). A brief group intervention using video games to teach sportsmanship skills to children with autism spectrum disorders. *Child & Family Behavior Therapy*, *35*(4), 293-306.
- Gal, E., Lamash, L., Bauminger-Zviely, N., Zancanaro, M., & Weiss, P. L. (2016). Using multitouch collaboration technology to enhance social interaction of children with high-functioning autism. *Physical & occupational therapy in pediatrics*, *36*(1), 46-58.
- Goldsmith, T. R. (2008). *Using virtual reality enhanced behavioral skills training to teach street-crossing skills to children and adolescents with Autism Spectrum Disorders*. Western Michigan University.

- Grynszpan, O., Martin, J. C., & Nadel, J. (2008). Multimedia interfaces for users with high functioning autism: An empirical investigation. *International Journal of Human-Computer Studies*, 66(8), 628-639.
- Herrera, G., Alcantud, F., Jordan, R., Blanquer, A., Labajo, G., & De Pablo, C. (2008). Development of symbolic play through the use of virtual reality tools in children with autistic spectrum disorders: Two case studies. *Autism*, 12(2), 143-157.
- Hsu, C. W., & Teoh, Y. S. (2017). Investigating Event Memory in Children with Autism Spectrum Disorder: Effects of a Computer-Mediated Interview. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, 47(2), 359-372.
- Ke, F., & Im, T. (2013). Virtual-reality-based social interaction training for children with high-functioning autism. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 106(6), 441-461.
- Kim, K., Rosenthal, M. Z., Gwaltney, M., Jarrold, W., Hatt, N., McIntyre, N., ... & Mundy, P. (2015). A virtual joy-stick study of emotional responses and social motivation in children with autism spectrum disorder. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, 45(12), 3891-3899.
- Lahiri, U., Bekele, E., Dohrmann, E., Warren, Z., & Sarkar, N. (2013). Design of a virtual reality based adaptive response technology for children with autism. *IEEE Transactions on Neural Systems and Rehabilitation Engineering*, 21(1), 55-64.
- Lahiri, U., Bekele, E., Dohrmann, E., Warren, Z., & Sarkar, N. (2015). A physiologically informed virtual reality based social communication system for individuals with autism. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, 45(4), 919-931.
- Maskey, M., Lowry, J., Rodgers, J., McConachie, H., & Parr, J. R. (2014). Reducing specific phobia/fear in young people with autism spectrum disorders (ASDs) through a virtual reality environment intervention. *PloS one*, 9(7), e100374.
- Mitchell, P., Parsons, S., & Leonard, A. (2007). Using virtual environments for teaching social understanding to 6 adolescents with autistic spectrum disorders. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, 37(3), 589-600.
- Moore, D., Cheng, Y., McGrath, P., & Powell, N. J. (2005). Collaborative virtual environment technology for people with autism. *Focus on autism and other developmental disabilities*, 20(4), 231-243.
- Özen, A. (2015). Effectiveness of Siblings-Delivered iPad Game Activities in Teaching Social Interaction Skills to Children with Autism Spectrum Disorders. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 15(5), 1287-1303.
- Parsons, S., Mitchell, P., & Leonard, A. (2004). The use and understanding of virtual environments by adolescents with autistic spectrum disorders. *Journal of Autism and Developmental disorders*, 34(4), 449-466.
- Rice, L. M., Wall, C. A., Fogel, A., & Shic, F. (2015). Computer-assisted face processing instruction improves emotion recognition, mentalizing, and social skills in students with ASD. *Journal of autism and developmental disorders*, 45(7), 2176-2186.
- Self, T., Scudder, R. R., Weheba, G., & Crumrine, D. (2007). A virtual approach to teaching safety skills to children with autism spectrum disorder. *Topics in Language disorders*, 27(3), 242-253.
- Stichter, J. P., Laffey, J., Galyen, K., & Herzog, M. (2014). iSocial: Delivering the social competence intervention for adolescents (SCI-A) in a 3D virtual learning environment for youth with high functioning autism. *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 44, 417-430. doi:10.1007/s10803-013-1881-0
- Strickland, D., Marcus, L. M., Mesibov, G. B., & Hogan, K. (1996). Brief report: Two case studies using virtual reality as a learning tool for autistic children. *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 26(6), 651-659.

Wang, X., Laffey, J., Xing, W., Ma, Y., & Stichter, J. (2016). Exploring embodied social presence of youth with Autism in 3D collaborative virtual learning environment: A case study. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 55, 310-321.